Shrill Echoes from the Hollow Earth: Transgressive Intellectualism and Inner Earth Utopia

Holly Folk
Shrill Echoes from the Hollow Earth: Transgressive Intellectualism and Inner Earth Utopia

Holly Folk

Alternative cosmographies like the hollow Earth are a means for imagining solutions to problems associated with cultural change. Not only are underground civilizations a theme in many literary utopias, hollow-Earth ideas have figured into the structuring ideologies of many intentional communities. Rodney M. Cluff, of Sun City, Arizona, is one of the most active current proponents of the “inner Earth.” With a self-published book (World Top Secret: The World IS Hollow!) and website (ourhollowearth.com), Cluff has succeeded in becoming one of the most visible proponents of hollow-Earth beliefs. For many years he sought to coordinate an expedition to the North Pole to find the polar opening modeled on the one proposed by John Cleve Symmes. More recently (it seems that the hollow-Earth expeditions lost feasibility), he has endeavored to create a virtual community. His side interests include selling gold bullion and “forced matrix” investment programs (pyramid/Ponzi financial plans). And he praises alternative energy inventions, like the constant electricity generators of John R. R. Searl—“a powerful electrogravitic force.”¹

Rodney Cluff has gained both notoriety and an internet following. He started the ourhollowearth.com in the late 1990s, and for many years was a popular site on the internet. In the past few years, interest in his projects has fallen off. There was a dramatic drop in users in the summer of 2017. Even then, however, almost 21,000 people visited the site each month.²

Cluff’s ventures offer ample reason for skepticism, standing as obstacles to understanding how he fits into a cultural milieu with a startling number of believers. As controversial as they seem, his projects place Rodney Cluff among other metaphysical entrepreneurs, showing both historic continuities and potential innovations for utopias created in modern, information-based societies. I am not seeking to “bracket” his motives, but Cluff both demonstrates a personal need to reconcile science and religion, and recognizes that need in others. His ideas embed him in a long lineage of alternative thinkers, whom I here propose calling “transgressive intellectuals.”
Belief in the hollow Earth is a very good example of the text-based “spiritual religion” first described by Ernst Troeltsch. Troeltsch felt the print revolution in the nineteenth century had important consequences for how people approached religious questions. A greater array of reading options exposed people to new religious and philosophical ideas. The modern religious style was characterized by independent believers creating personalized worldviews. Troeltsch criticized modern religion as increasingly individualist and without checks and balances. When considering the bricolage of hollow-Earth ideas, one can appreciate his point.

The genealogy of hollow-Earth ideas has been chronicled by Jeffrey Kripal, Michael Barkun, Brad Whitsel, and Jocelyn Godwin. Myths and folklore sometimes are invoked as proof that the truth about our planet is ancient knowledge. More important, starting in the Enlightenment, some mathematicians and scientists proposed alternative geologies to account for gaps in scientific knowledge, such as issues with the magnetic north pole, the Earth’s gravitational field, or questions when calculating the Earth’s mass.

Around 1818-1820, John Cleves Symmes proposed a hollow-Earth concept that differs somewhat from the dominant theory today, envisioning the world as a set of concentric spheres, sort of like a round Matryoshka doll. This version was loosely associated with the mathematician Edmund Halley. Symmes died in 1829, but his ideas continued to be popular through the mid-nineteenth century, and appear to have been embraced by a number of Mormon figures.

Few believe in Symmes’s model today. More often, the world is envisioned as a sort of tube, with openings at each pole, and possibly other entrances. Symmes believed the interior of our planet was illuminated by light from our own sun, penetrating deep into the planet. By the twentieth century, the majority of proponents suggested there was a smaller sun (the “Smoky God”) within the planet, allowing for the possibility for an entire hidden world to exist within our known one.

Hollow-Earth ideas are strongly associated with Rosicrucianism. They also are found in Theosophy. In both those traditions, the inner Earth is linked to the mystical Tibetan city of Aghartha (various spellings). In the early twentieth century, proponents increased their attention to scientific dimensions; this did not let up after Peary’s excursions in the Arctic. In the mid-twentieth century, hollow-Earth ideas were combined with UFO
beliefs, with the Rosicrucian thinker Raymond Bernard an important contributor. Bernard posited that the “flying saucers” reported by so many Americans in the 1950s were making their excursions from within the planet.9

The beliefs accompany theories about the lost continents of Lemuria and Atlantis, and have been carried forth in New Age culture. Mt. Shasta is a site of critical importance, though there are other potential apertures through which one can penetrate the inner Earth, including Mammoth Cave in Kentucky, Mount Epomeo in Italy, and the Pyramid of Giza in Egypt. Here, let me relate a broader point that I first learned from Jean-Francois Meyer—that the multiple idea systems that feed into hollow-Earth beliefs (like the different physical entrances into the planet), create many points of entry into the worldview, as well as into the world.

In considering hollow-Earth ideas and lore, one should be aware of the great interweaving of fiction with fact. Fantasy novels and science fiction have sometimes been rather widely interpreted as factual accounts masquerading as fiction, three important ones being Edward Bulwer Lytton’s The Coming Race (1871); The Smoky God by Willis George Emerson (1908), and in the 1940s, the “Shaver Mysteries” of Ray Palmer.10 These accounts (along with others) not only expand upon geological propositions behind the beliefs, they often carry a utopian theme. It is not an accident that the inner Earth often is imagined to hold a perfected civilization of highly evolved humanoids.

Latter-day Saints’ interest in the hollow Earth goes as far back as the 1830s, when Symmes’s concentric spheres model was circulating in American popular intellectual culture. Much authority is drawn from an apocryphal story of Benjamin Johnson proposing Joseph Smith’s receptivity to Symmes’s ideas:

I asked where the nine and a half tribes of Israel were. “Well,” said he, “you remember the old caldron or potash kettle you used to boil maple sap in for sugar, don’t you?” I said yes. “Well,” said he, “they are in the north pole in a concave just the shape of that kettle. And John the Revelator is with them, preparing them for their return.”11

Brigham Young also apparently was told the location of the Lost Tribes by Joseph Smith. In a diary entry from September 8, 1867,
Wilford Woodruff reports that,

President Young said he had heard Joseph Smith say that the Ten Tribes of Israel were on a portion of land separated from this earth. He had also heard Joseph say that children would not grow after death and at another time that they would grow and he hardly knew how to reconcile it. He would like a variety in eternity. Children might grow in intelligence and not in stature as well as a grown person. If his children were grown up after leaving him, he would not know them.¹²

In the Mormon version, hollow Earth-ideas converged with theories about the Lost Tribes of Israel and the location of the Garden of Eden, as well as (anti-evolutionist) British Israelite notions that discounted African origins for early humans.¹³ These ideas entered the Mormon orbit, where they continue as “speculative doctrines”—not official teachings, but not condemned by the Church. Speculations are shared informally and sometimes as personal teachings.

For years now, I’ve asked Latter-day Saints about the hollow Earth whenever the opportunity afforded. Scholars and civilians have both corroborated what I myself have discovered, and what Cluff himself helped document: that hollow-Earth theory is a common folk belief among Mormons in the Mountain West.

Rodney Cluff grew up in the Colonia Juarez in Mexico, and studied at Brigham Young University as a young man. He worked as an information technology specialist for the Arizona Department of Health Services until he retired, and now lives in Sun City, Arizona. When Cluff was sixteen and working in New Mexico, he learned about the hollow Earth from the son of a farm manager. Later on, he discovered the LDS version—that the twelve tribes went into the Earth. Cluff claims the first book he read on the topic was Raymond Bernard’s *The Hollow Earth*, though he cites and refers to a great number of sources in his book, *World Top Secret*.

Cluff credits his interest in science and religion to Mormonism: “And by the power of the Holy Ghost ye may know the truth of all things.”

It is by application of this scientific test to that book of ancient American scripture that I came to a knowledge that it is of God, because God did answer my prayer and let me know by the
power of the Holy Ghost of its truthfulness. Millions of Latter-day Saints have performed this same test and received the same answer of the divinity of that book. Therefore, it could be said that Mormonism is a scientific religion.14

Cluff regards both Mormon theology and hollow-Earth knowledge as scientific, based in investigation, discovery, and the individual search for truth. His e-book carries active links to the LDS website offering free Bibles and copies of the Book of Mormon. In World Top Secret Cluff uses equations, formulas, and diagrams to rewrite fundamental scientific laws, like the “gravitation constant.” His meditation on science and religion continues for more than 450 pages, arguing in the appendices for the existence of a “god force” that helps explain “unified field theory.” The appendices have long sections of calculations of numbers that relate to the earth’s cosmography—gravity, tides, the earth’s mass, orbit of the moon, etc. One shouldn’t overlook his proposal in “A More Correct Gravitation Force Formula,” in which Cluff is joining some transgressive intellectuals in revising the law of gravity.15 Cluff uses the hollow Earth to refute Darwinian evolution and reject carbon dating.16

The version presented in Cluff’s book changes the dimensions set out in John Uri Loyd’s work, Etidorpha, but the paradigm is the same: a polar sea, about four hundred miles across, hidden by an ice field two hundred miles in every direction.17 The outer shell of the earth is eight hundred miles thick; one can take a twelve hundred mile channel down—at narrowest point (where the aperture is only forty miles wide) the sea gives way to a hidden continent, which one needs to traverse to get to the interior of the planet. Unlike many hollow-Earth proponents, but evocative of Symmes, he reports that sunlight travels down to center of planet. Geothermal energy and planetary rotation give the inner-Earth seasons, but there is no internal sun.

Cluff cites numerous LDS scriptures to argue that the “North Country” of the Lost Tribes is the hollow Earth. Cluff calls the denizens of the inner Earth the “Hollow Earth Nation of Israelites.” He insists that the denizens of the hollow Earth live in an economic cooperative similar to the Order of Enoch.18 Cluff sees an international conspiracy of communist illuminati as secretly controlling world government and concealing information about the hollow Earth: the International Illuminist-Communist Conspiracy.
Cluff regards the “Hollow Earth Nation” as fundamentally peaceful, and charged by God to prevent world destruction by the illuminati.

A typical statement (from the preface) reads: “The majority of the flying saucers sighted around the world are the military of the Hollow Earth Nation of Israelites and are operating a DEFENSIVE against the INTERNATIONAL ILLUMINIST-COMMUNIST CONSPIRACY!”

In a later chapter, he reassures readers that “the Hollow Earth Nation is not afraid of the peoples of outer earth, nor their leaders. They are on a mission for the Creator to keep the Illuminati from blowing up the planet. And their message to the people is that of peace, love and harmony.”

Cluff’s book is a pastiche of ideas from Mormonism, esotericism, and pseudoscience, but it is consistent with the style of thought supporting hollow-Earth thought, and also is indicative of directions much modern spirituality is taking. The attention to apocalyptic thought in Cluff’s hollow-Earth theory is meaningful. In A Culture of Conspiracy, Michael Barkun argues that in the present day, millenarian belief is more likely to be expressed as conspiracy theories than prophecies about the end times. He calls this new style “improvisational millennialism.” Building on Barkun’s work, Charlotte Ward and David Voas proposed “conspirituality” as an emerging subtype of alternative religion. Conspirituality is a hybrid belief system, blending “feminine” New Age ideas with “masculine” conspiracy theories. Ward and Voas are somewhat concerned with the growing popularity of the conspiritual style, which they, like Barkun, see as a symptom of political disillusionment. Conspiritualists see the world as imperiled by a new world order, and they alternately look to God, aliens, or other supreme beings to help radically restructure society or human life—apocalypse meets utopia. Cluff’s beliefs in UFOs and world-government theories, and his participation in the sovereign citizen movement embed him in the conspiritual world.

In the preface to World Top Secret, Cluff provides an account of the attempted polar expeditions, which resemble the one proposed by Symmes in the 1820s. Cluff’s plan was to fly to the Arctic to find North Pole opening, then charter an icebreaking ship, Yamal, to get as near the pole as possible. Because the trip only promised Arctic tourism and a search for the hollow Earth, the offer should not be dismissed as fraudulent. In fairness, a good deal of the funds raised for a successful expedition would have gone to the tour company, so that the costs of the expedition may be more easily accounted for than some of his other projects. Cluff names
as associates a figure named Steve Currey (deceased), of the Expedition Company in Provo, Utah, and Brooks Agnew, a one-time developer of electric cars (Vision Motor Cars). Cluff’s newest associate will probably sow more doubts: in 2008 he met “Col.” Billie Faye Woodard, who claims to be a hermaphrodite born in the hollow Earth, and adopted by human parents. Cluff raised money with online campaigns until 2013. I do not know if I would entirely trust his version of events, but it seems the first expedition was canceled because of Currey’s death; the second was blocked by Agnew’s resignation in 2013.

Cluff has justified ending the hollow-Earth expeditions with a fairly libertarian rationale—individuals are “empowered” to go on their own. He made this explicit in an email sent out to his list of email followers:

I am working on empowering as many people interested in going to Our Hollow Earth as I can. So that if you want to go, now you can. Before, we had expedition leaders who got knocked off for one reason or another. Two died and one resigned because of financial blackmail…. Each of us now will be empowered to go on our own, so don’t tell anyone what you are really doing.

Cluff offered to help make this dream possible by inviting fans to participate in his “forced matrix” plans, which, he assures readers of the website and recipients of his emails, will generate more than enough money for anyone to launch a polar expedition. He promised that his “3x8 forced matrix” had a “marketing genie,” so that, with bonuses, one could earn as much as $1,017,317 a month.

Possible income? Over $32,817 a month. You will soon become a millionaire! It is a 3x8 forced matrix. So you can’t lose. When your first 30 get their matrix filled, you will be earning $1,017,327 each MONTH with matching bonuses that this company pays. You earn what they earn in addition to your own, called matching bonuses. But it doesn’t stop there. You will get an ever-increasing income with this program.

31 people (you and your first 30) x $32,817 = $1,017,327 EACH month.

How much does the program cost? Only $79 to start, and $59 a month until your commissions start coming in.
It is New. It’s Exciting. It’s Global, with a HUGE potential, and a cost you can afford to get started.

Have a look... maybe it is what we have been looking for -- Something that works. Something that will give you the money you need to go to Paradise, or stay here, if that’s what you want.²⁶

The email included a link for readers to follow for information about the force-matrix plan (which has been disabled). And the email ended with an invitation for recipients to consider joining another venture. Since abandoning the hollow-Earth expeditions, Rodney Cluff has devoted more attention to the establishment of his “Virtual City of Light,” a web-based intentional community that Cluff hopes will generate the money and human interest to support creating a new society. He acknowledges the preliminary stage of his project, but retains his optimism:

As indicated, this city is a virtual city at the present time, existing only over the Internet. As soon as our virtual City of Light is up and running efficiently, then a physical city of light will be created on the ground. Once that physical city is running efficiently, it will duplicate itself somewhere else. This duplication will continue thus filling our world with cities of light. We will then expand out into outer space and to other worlds.²⁷

Here’s an intriguing question for communal studies: when an individual or group embarks on planning a community, what comes first? Buying land? Implementing religious rules? Starting a group business? Rodney’s City of Light plan is long on fundraising, but beyond imagining the circular design of the metropolis, he’s paid minimal attention to actual city planning. He has, however, reimagined important parts of the human experience, especially our use and understanding of time. His plans are laid out in the City Charter for the Virtual City of Light:

The City Charter for the Virtual City of Light (author’s paraphrase):

- Under the City Charter, the Virtual City of Light will run on a shifting-clock system, with different “Home SubSectors” will run on shifting clocks, with four hour delays. This will let the city operate on a twenty-four hour basis. The work week will be four
days long, with three-day weekends. Each work day will carry an equal amount of work, organized recreation, and personal time (four hours on each), with eight hours allocated for personal time. The Home SubSectors will each recognize a sabbath, but the official day of rest will rotate/be different for Home SubSectors (I cannot tell from the City Charter). The weekends will be entirely allocated to personal time.

- The City Layout is in a circular design. When established, the city will have a central Public Sector (church, school, govt center and stores), and a surrounding Home Sector, divided into SubSectors. Around this, there will be an Agricultural and Industrial Sector—in other words, concentric rings of development, evocative of the concentric circles of Symmes’ hollow Earth.

- The City economy will run on Cluff’s Asset Based Receipt Monetary System. While there are not immediate plans for business or industry, Cluff imagines that in the future, “A base specialization industry could be the building of gravity powered electric generators and flying saucer craft that could double as mobile homes.”

Would you like to join? There are clear instructions on how to “become a citizen.” It is best to print them verbatim, so here they are:

Become a Citizen
- Pay a voluntary income tax to the Virtual City of Light on 10% of your gross salaried income and 10% on the net of your business income. Your voluntary income tax payment will give you voting status in the Virtual City of Light.
- Receive from the Virtual City of Light a receipt for taxes paid in the form of new money issued by the Virtual City of Light called, “Lights,” in the same amount as your taxes paid. This will more than double your income in every ten-year period.
- Accept payment in the currency of the Virtual City of Light for taxes paid and products and services you sell to citizens of the Virtual City of Light.
- Post to the Virtual City of Light website ads of products and services you provide for other citizens to purchase. By building our Virtual City of Light economy, we can help each other provide
for all our needs and wants in a stable economy.

- Vote for city officials.
- Vote on expenditures city officials put forth on expenditure proposals for approval and disapproval of the citizens. All Virtual City of Light expenditures will be upon majority vote approval of Virtual City of Light citizens.²⁸

With the slogan, “Harmony, Integrity and Prosperity for All,” Cluff also wants to create a new monetary system via an amendment to the U.S. Constitution.²⁹ His proposed constitutional amendment (Asset-Based Receipt Monetary System for the United States of America and for a United World) would abolish the Federal Reserve Act of 1913 (“a fraud on the American people”) and issue a new currency—United States currency (asset based, with a value established by GNP). The new United States currency would be released to the public through refunds of voluntary 10 percent income taxes. Cluff’s amendment also would cancel all credit card debt, and convert all other debt to the new United States currency. Lastly, it revises the IRS code to reduce income tax to 10 percent and makes it voluntary. The incentive is that tax returns come in new United States currency, the only valid money. Cluff promises this system will not create inflation, which seems to be his greatest worry. He also would tariff all imports but eliminate all other taxes, and repeal the seventeenth Amendment to the Constitution (the direct election of senators)—returning power of appointment to state legislatures. The plan would invite other countries to participate by adopting U.S. currency, but requiring they adopt the 10 percent voluntary income tax system. On foreign policy matters, Cluff calls for the withdrawal from the United Nations (and its eviction from territorial U.S.) and recalling U.S. troops abroad.

The fact that, however abstractly, Rodney is seeking to create a virtual community puts him into the purview of communal studies. Many literary utopias have paralleled or even inspired actual communes, and it is only a matter of time before a communal society in cyberspace generates a living community. Furthermore, alternative geologies, including hollow-Earth beliefs, have shown up as idea systems in many alternative religions with communal experiments. The most famous is the Koreshan Unity in Estero, Florida, which promoted a unique concave-Earth theory. Others include Zion City, Illinois, where church leaders promoted flat-Earth theory. Hollow-Earth ideas have coursed through the I AM movement,
the Church Universal and Triumphant, Stelle, and the Order of the Solar Temple, as well as in the channeled revelations of JZ Knight and other New Age exponents. Together, these cases argue that reimagining the construction of the world is a significant project for spiritually-driven intentional communities.

Something to observe from Cluff’s venture and other experiments is the elective affinity between alternative medicine and alternative geology. Cluff has advertised liquid silver vitamin supplements (and gold bullion) on his website, and in the past two years has expanded his health content with a new section entitled, “Perfect Health --- Found!” By comparison, Cyrus Teed was an eclectic physician; Samuel Burley Rowbotham (formulator of flat-Earth theory) was a patent medicine dealer; Raymond Bernard/Walter Siegmeister was as known for his alternative health view as his contributions to hollow-Earth beliefs; and Luc Jouret, one of the leaders in the Order of the Solar Temple, was a naturopath with “health clubs” being the primary means of recruitment into the OST. One could propose several reasons this elective affinity—chance or charlatanry. At this point, I think it has something to do with “creep”—that flexibility for belief in one venture predisposes to alternative ideas in others.

I am disinclined to see Cluff’s projects as only get-rich-schemes, though I have great doubts about their practicality (and fairness). Others might entertain that other communes may also have been created as personal profit ventures. I am reminded of the work of Walter Thomas Mills (author of The Product-sharing Village), who, it seems, lent his token participation to the Hiawatha Village Association only as long as it was financially beneficial for him to do so.

Blog posts and reader responses suggest Cluff does not appear to have done much maintenance to the Virtual City of Light website since 2015, but it remains operational. Since June 2016, the forced-matrix website has been disabled, but Cluff’s venture into multi-level marketing seems to have damaged his popularity. Data analytics suggest there was a growth in traffic to the ourhollowearth.com website after he sent his email in June 2016, to me and several hundred other recipients. Cluff’s website visitors increased steadily over the summer and fall of 2016. They reached a peak in January 2017. That month, 25,000 users visited, but traffic began to decline after that—first slightly, and then very sharply starting in April 2017. Even now, however, the site earns several thousand visits a month. Rodney Cluff continues to update the website, with the most recent post
Cluff both confirms and problematizes what we think we know about deviant scientific beliefs. His work falls somewhere between fantasy and fraud—things often viewed as opposites, but which I have come to think run concurrently. I honestly cannot tell how much Cluff believes his own rhetoric, and think his ideas vary moment by moment. Ambiguity is a theme in Cluff’s work, and in the stream of hollow-Earth beliefs, which interweaves entertainment, investigation, and fraud. This is consistent with populist intellectual culture, where entrepreneurial “edutainment” often prevails. Note that Cluff is appealing to people with independent understandings of reality. The hollow Earth is an enchanted world where participants engage in a practical alchemy, expanding the realm of what is plausible and possible.

Notes

6. See Frederick Culmer, The Inner World: Based on Scientific and Theological Facts, Showing That The Earth Is a Hollow Sphere (Salt Lake City, 1886); also see Susan Peterson, “The Great and Dreadful Day: Mormon Folklore of the...


13. See Oliver B. Huntington, “The Inhabitants of the Moon,” *Young Woman’s Journal* 3 (1892): 264; also see Frederick Culmer, Sr. *The Inner World* (Salt Lake City, 1886).


15. Ibid., 510.

16. Ibid., xx-xxvi.

19. Ibid., xviii.
20. Ibid., 164.
24. The website for Currey Expedition Company, http://www.expeditioncompany.com/about_us.php, was accessible as recently as August 2016 but has been taken down. Cluff, however, continues to carry information about the trip on his website, see “Voyage to Hollow Earth Trip Information” http://www.voyagehollowearth.com/hollow_earth_trip_info.html (accessed September 9, 2017).
27. Ibid.
28. Ibid.
34. http://www.betterwaybuilder.com/rodneycluff/1/page2.php (accessed October 4, 2016) is no longer accessible and appears to have been taken down.

