Awaiting the Second Coming in the Piney Woods: The New House of Israel

Julieanna Frost
Awaiting the Second Coming in the Piney Woods: The New House of Israel

Julieanna Frost

In 1896, Christian Israelites from the New House of Israel community began leaving Port Huron, Michigan, in anticipation of the imminent return of Christ as preached by their leader, George Sutton. These faithful believers relocated to 144 acres in East Texas and referred to their new home as Israel. This paper explores the history and eschatology of this small sect of Christian Israelites.

Christian Israelites trace their origin to Joanna Southcott (1750-1815), whom they viewed as a prophet. She was a domestic servant from Devon, England, with limited education. Southcott began to have visions in her later years, relocated to London, and was reported to have had upwards of ten thousand followers during her lifetime. Though she was past childbearing years, the faithful believed that Southcott was pregnant with the Messiah. This physical birth did not occur to usher in the Second Coming; instead, Southcott passed away. Her death created a power vacuum, with various people vying for the leadership mantle of messenger. The movement splintered into several factions, each having divergent views of who were the authentic messengers after Southcott, as well as differences in religious practice. The branch that became most common in the Midwest of the United States acknowledged Joanna Southcott, Richard Brothers, George Turner, William Shaw, John Wroe, and James Jezreel as the true messengers. This faction was sometimes called the Jezreelites, or Flying Rollers.

This particular branch was established in the United States in 1878 when Jezreelite follower Clarissa Rogers traveled here on a fundraising and evangelistic tour. She was quite successful, making converts in several U.S. cities, such as Chicago, Philadelphia, Columbus, Cleveland, Boston, and Detroit. In 1879, James Jezreel published his work, Extracts from the Flying Roll. His followers also published a newspaper, Pioneer of Wisdom, to promote the faith. Jezreel married Rogers, and they journeyed to the United States together in 1880 to proselytize. It was during this trip that a convert from Grand Rapids, Michigan, Noah Drew, provided the couple with, “six wagons, a large marquee, and a hundred benches, and they toured the States like a travelling circus, pitching their tent outside town after
Extracts from the Flying Roll

Sermon 1

"I will utter things which have been kept secret from the foundation of the world." - Matt xiii. 35.

"Take thee again another roll, and write in it all the former words that were in the first roll, which Jehu shewed the king of Judah, that he had burned." - Jer. xxxvi. 28.

The front board of James Jezreel’s Extracts from the Flying Roll, 1879. Communal Societies Collection, Hamilton College
town, and urging the inhabitants to hear Jezreel and Clarissa … Converts were won and many dollars collected.” In Michigan, Christian Israelite communes would eventually exist in the cities of Detroit and Benton Harbor. Additionally, canvassers were located in towns such as Dowagiac, Battle Creek, Jackson, Grand Rapids, Marshall, and Port Huron.

George Sutton was the canvasser in Port Huron, where he was born in 1857. He married Emily Mather in 1880. At the time of his marriage, he still lived at home and worked as a sewing machine salesman. George and Emily had two children—a daughter, Ada, and a son, Charles. It is uncertain when Sutton became a Christian Israelite. He possibly became acquainted with the faith through canvassers in Sarnia, Ontario, located six miles away, as there was a fairly substantial Christian Israelite community there. Missionary Michael Mills, who eventually founded the God House commune in Detroit, preached there as well. Sutton held meetings in Port Huron by 1890 and was listed in the Jezreelite weekly newspaper Pioneer of Wisdom as a contact person for obtaining copies of Extracts from the Flying Roll. One convert testified how George Sutton impacted his life:

I have been a member of two different churches and I have been reaching out after food (the bread of life), but I have been, as it were, floating out in deep waters like a drowning man grasping at a straw, but alas I found nothing to hold fast to until I met G.S. in Port Huron, and that came about in a way that is past my comprehension. I was on my way to Michigan to look for a farm to buy, and having friends in Port Huron, I stopped over Sunday and was led by some unknown power to go and hear Israel’s faith explained, and then led to withdraw from the society I belonged to. I am rejoicing today in the pearl of price.
George Sutton's listing as a distributor for Extracts from the Flying Roll out of Port Huron, Michigan.
Though the above informant was very positive about Sutton and his abilities, in reality Sutton had difficulty in convincing the public even to purchase *Pioneer of Wisdom*, which only cost three cents. He reported, “Though I did not effect any sales, yet I am persuaded my labors were not in vain.”

Sutton was promoting a faith that believed in strictly adhering to both the Law and Gospel, reasoning that both Christians and Jews were in error by not following the whole Bible. Jezreelites viewed themselves as Nazarites, and so prohibited the cutting of hair, drinking of alcohol, use of tobacco, contact with dead bodies, and eating non-kosher foods. Because kosher food was often difficult to obtain in the United States at this time, quite a few Christian Israelites sects were vegetarian, though those groups also pointed to Scripture to support their diet. Fornication was also forbidden, and some Jezreelite sects required celibacy. There were Jezreelites that encouraged communal living as a principle of the ingathering, living in purity like Christ, as His brothers and sisters.

One commonality to all followers of Jezreel was a belief in the millennium. Jezreel described a time when “the Virgins of Israel appointed to their tribes will rejoice and praise the God of Jacob, harping upon their harps and they will sing the New New Song which none can learn save the sealed of Israel—the 144,000, redeemed from the corruptible earth—the dead earth, into living earth, into immortality.” An interpretation from the seventh book of Revelation, further expected that these redeemed would reign with Christ for one thousand years, which “will shortly commence.” Some Jezreelite groups actually predicted the date of Christ’s return, which caused problems when that date arrived with no sign of the Messiah.

Sutton preached a millennialist message. Although he did not gain many converts to the faith, he still founded the New House of Israel on April 1, 1891, in Port Huron. Sutton convinced his tiny group of seven adult followers that the fiery destruction of the world and its inhabitants, (save the 144,000—among whom they were numbered), was imminent. One newspaper reported, “One of the number some months ago found a roll of writing, together with a chart, on which it was indicated that this number of persons was to be saved from the burning, and that the place where they were to live was where they are now located. This place was said to be ‘heaven’ in the chart, or ‘Israel.’ It was to be in a wilderness, on lands totally unfit for cultivation.” The location indicated on this roll was a plot of land near Livingston, Texas. Another account from the converted
Shanabarger family, who were apparently the only non-relatives connected to the New House of Israel while it was in Michigan, related: “When the ark of God’s new covenant was brought forth according to divine order the Shanabarger family were among the witnesses. The ark here spoken of (Rev. 11, 19) was brought forth July 1, A.D., 1894 and dedicated to the New House of Israel, the Living Temple.”13 The elect were to donate their wealth and travel to the place they called “Israel” to await the Second Coming.

Most of this wealth came from the Shanabarger family, who were instrumental in the founding of Israel, Texas. Both Sarah Yeaman and Ephraim Shanabarger spent their formative years in Richland County, Ohio, but the circumstances of their respective youths were radically different.14 While Sarah’s family was economically stable, Ephraim was forced into indenture after he was orphaned at the age of seventeen. Accounts of their courtship are lacking, but the two were wed on Christmas day, 1855. After their marriage, they lived with Sarah’s family on a four-hundred-acre farm in Bloom Township, Wood County, in the northwest region of the state.15 After her parents passed away, Sarah inherited some of this property—approximately 216 acres near Cygnet, Ohio—and she and Ephraim built a farmhouse for themselves.16 Five children resulted from their union: Francis, born in 1856; Martha, born in 1858; Celestia, born in 1865 (she died prior to adulthood); Henry, born in 1869; and Minnie, born in 1872. According to an 1870 census their wealth stood at $6500. In a history of the region written in 1896, the Shanabargers are portrayed as a successful family, but this was soon to change.

Some people immigrated to this region of Ohio in search of economic wealth. Cygnet was located in the region known as the Great Black Swamp. A large drainage project in the 1850s opened the area to settlement, and the rich soil left behind was suited for agriculture. However, what had been a sleepy, rural location turned into an oil boomtown overnight. In 1884, a large oil field was discovered in Northwest Ohio.17 The work A History of Northwest Ohio contained this description: “Oil was found in no less than sixteen townships, indicating that hundreds of feet beneath was a vast lake of oil. Prices for land went skyward. Farms that previously could have been purchased for from $10 to $50 an acre could not be had for less than hundreds of dollars per acre.”18 Speculation was rampant and numerous oil-related businesses were created during the boom. From 1895 to 1903, Ohio was the leading oil-producing state with 380 million
barrels of oil and two trillion cubic feet of gas extracted.\textsuperscript{19} The population swelled as workers came to Wood County from Pennsylvania.\textsuperscript{20} Cygnet became the largest boomtown in Wood County, and by 1890 its population exceeded 3,000 people.\textsuperscript{21} In addition to legitimate businesses connected to the petrochemical industry, there were also the enterprises typically surrounding a boomtown with a male workforce, namely saloons, gambling houses, and brothels. The proliferation of blatantly sinful behaviors would have concerned many in this once-bucolic community.

Another group of itinerants focused on saving souls from this newfound Sodom and Gomorrah. Missionaries representing various Christian denominations passed through Wood County during this period. Cygnet itself was only been surveyed in 1883, and in lieu of established churches preachers traveled from community to community. These missionaries visited groups of believers in their homes until enough support existed to found a physical church. Though practically extinct today, one sect that sent out many missionaries throughout the United States in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries was the Christian Israelites. This group were quite successful in the Midwest, especially in Michigan and Ohio. In Ohio alone, pockets of Christian Israelite converts were located in Columbus, Cincinnati, Cleveland, London, and Fostoria.

Two of the most successful Christian Israelite missionaries in the United States were Benjamin and Mary Purnell. Initially, they were connected to the Christian Israelite community called the God House, located in Detroit, Michigan. Mary Purnell related:

\begin{quote}
We began our first traveling in 1894. We walked and preached from one to three times a day, in open streets and different churches, halls, etc. We often spoke of the Scripture, "The foxes have holes and the birds of the air have nests, but the Son of man hath nowhere to lay His head to rest." But that divine Spirit was with us and would show us where we could stop to rest, and they would so quickly get interested and keep us, and in the morning when we would leave they would shed tears at our departure. We traveled through Indiana, Ohio, and into Kentucky, holding good meetings, and then from Kentucky into Illinois.\textsuperscript{22}
\end{quote}

In 1895, the Purnell’s broke away from God House,\textsuperscript{23} and claimed to be the next messengers after Jezreel. They preached throughout Ohio and
wrote numerous works about the faith, perhaps the most famous being *The Star of Bethlehem*. Mary announced:

> The full and complete message is now written and can be obtained, by which Paradise will be restored and death abolished, and Satan bound and afterwards destroyed, and all tears shall be wiped off all faces, and there shall be no more sorrow nor crying; neither shall there be any more death, for the former things shall have passed away and all things become new; when the kingdoms of this world shall become the kingdoms of our Lord and His Christ, a new heaven and a new earth, wherein the desert shall rejoice and bloom as a rose, and the earth yield her seven fold.\(^{24}\)

The Christian Israelite message provided much comfort to people experiencing upheavals in society, such as the Shanabarger family. In 1902,\(^{25}\) the Purnells founded their first community in Fostoria, Ohio. Fostoria is only thirteen miles away from Cygnet. The next year, the Purnells relocated to Benton Harbor, Michigan, and established the most successful Christian Israelite colony, the Israelite House of David. After her husband’s death, Mary founded another colony called the the Israelite House of David, as Re-organized by Mary Purnell, commonly known as Mary’s City of David. Both colonies still exist, though membership has dwindled to a total of four people.

The historical record is silent on when the Shanabargers first came in contact with the Christian Israelites, and if it was the Purnells who brought them the message of the Ingathering. Although in later newspaper accounts of their divorce Ephraim acted as if his wife alone had come under the control of the Christian Israelites, in fact both of them, as well as other family members, were once believers in the faith. Both Sarah and Ephraim had joined the New House of Israel of Port Huron, Michigan, by July 1, 1894,\(^{26}\) and one reference links Ephraim to the God House of Detroit,\(^{27}\) which could place his conversion as early as 1891, when that colony was founded. If that is true, it is possible that the Shanabargers shifted their allegiance from the God House to the New House of Israel after a conviction was upheld for the leader of the God House, Michael Mills. The Michigan Supreme Court affirmed during its January session of 1893 Mill’s sentence for carnally knowing a girl between the ages of fourteen and sixteen.\(^{28}\) The resulting scandal caused many Christian Israelites to
affiliate with other groups or leave the faith all together.

According to one newspaper account, the New House of Israel believed Jesus’s return would take place February 20, 1901, in which case the need for relocation would have been urgent. Texans Joe and Elizabeth Peebles, both Christian Israelites, deeded their 144 acres located in the east piney woods to “The Lord God of Heaven and Earth, The God of Israel,” on September 10, 1895. The initial exodus for believers from Michigan was complete on November 20, 1896. These seventeen emigrants comprised the Sutton family, including George’s mother and father, and the Connor family, connected to the Suttons by marriage. As members of the faithful, the Shanabargers were expected to leave their Ohio home for Texas. Sarah moved to Israel, Texas, on October 6, 1897. It is uncertain when her son Francis left for Texas with his family, but another son, Henry, left for Texas with his family after October 16, 1897. On that date that Henry entered into an agreement with his father Ephraim to pay $500 for the remaining family property. Henry also promised to pay off his father’s debts, totaling approximately $1,000, and to provide for Ephraim’s maintenance in his old age. With the arrival of half of the Shanabarger family, the colony consisted of fourteen adults. Francis Shanabarger stated that, “This is the faith once delivered to the saints as witnessed by Job 33:23-25, and a host of others. And they all died in the faith, not receiving the promise. The promise is to the ‘Elect,’ Rev. 14, who are to be gathered out from one end of heaven to the other.” Unfortunately, his father Ephraim ultimately did not go with them to join the Elect.

It will never be known for certain why Ephraim stayed behind. He was a proud Christian Israelite for many years, on that basis one would have expected him to go to Israel. The central issue seems to have revolved around money. Perhaps Ephraim’s choice to stay in Ohio exemplifies the scripture 1 Timothy 6:10, “The love of money is the root of all evil.” After oil was discovered on some of the Shanabarger farmland, their wealth increased to a reported $75,000, making them one of the wealthiest families in Wood County. This wealth predated their conversion to the faith, and Sarah believed it should be used to support the relocation of the Christian Israelite community to Texas.

In 1899, Sarah petitioned the court to grant her half of the family’s accumulated wealth. This may have been in response to a series of lawsuits against her husband by creditors. In Sarah’s absence Ephraim incurred more debt and promised to pay creditors with land that he no longer owned,
as he had already sold it to his son Henry. In the case Bowlus v. Shanabarger (1899) it is insinuated that Henry had entered into a secret agreement with his father to defraud his creditors.\textsuperscript{36} Henry was cleared of any wrongdoing but Sarah’s lawsuit may have been initiated in part to protect the property. Sarah alleged that Ephraim mismanaged the wealth from the oil lease on the land that she inherited.\textsuperscript{37} She also claimed, “When oil was discovered in this section the oil people proposed to Mr. Shanabarger to lease one acre of land from him but after the papers were signed it was discovered that the lease included the entire tract.”\textsuperscript{38} Ephraim’s ignorance cost the family thousands of dollars; further, by law he did not have standing to enter into this agreement according to Sarah. For much of the nineteenth century, U.S. women were under coverture and did not have legal standing with regard to their own property. This began to change on a state-by-state basis with the Married Women’s Property Acts. Ohio passed such an act in 1861, which reads in part, “Any estate or interest, legal or equitable, in real property, belonging to any woman at her marriage, or which may have come to her during coverture or conveyance, gift, devise, or inheritance, or by purchase with her separate money or means, shall, together with all rents and issues thereof, be and remain her separate property, and under her sole control.”\textsuperscript{39} Sarah claimed that she did not know how Ephraim illegally had the land conveyed to him. In reality, she almost certainly knew the property was sold to Henry, but was attempting to use this excuse to protect what remained of the family wealth in case the court in the Bowlus lawsuit found Henry at fault.

Ephraim denied any wrongdoing and claimed Sarah had wasted their wealth to support the Christian Israelites. He portrayed her as a woman seduced by religious charlatans. One newspaper account stated, “A strange religious sect sprung up in the neighborhood and the wife and the sons became affiliated with this sect. With the coming of this religion to the members of the family came trouble and ill fortune to Ephraim Shanabarger. Business ventures proved unfruitful and disaster followed disaster.”\textsuperscript{40} In newspaper accounts, Ephraim portrayed himself as an innocent victim of his wife and her religious convictions. Unsurprisingly, most press accounts were highly biased against the Christian Israelites and ridiculed the group. Headlines included \textit{A “Heaven” in Texas, This “Heaven” is Controlled by Wife}, and \textit{Wife Went to “Heaven.”} One account included a rare positive statement by W. F. Gibson, who stated, “It is true these people seem somewhat peculiar in that like the Jews they do not allow their members to
eat hog meat, but I believe them to be nice, virtuous, intelligent people, but somewhat misguided.”41 In 1900, three years after Sarah left him behind in Ohio, Ephraim filed for divorce, and took the unusual step of suing sue for alimony. The St. Paul Globe reported:

Yesterday in a petition for alimony from his wife he told his pitiful tale. He states that he is now an outcast; penniless, with no home, no friends, and nothing but the poorhouse between him and starvation. He says that he was once rich and that he and his wife and children lived happily together till the wife became imbued with certain strange religious ideas, after which she deserted him leaving him, then old and infirm, to support her and their sons, and the place they set up in Texas, as well as himself.42

Courts traditionally granted alimony to wives in divorce settlements, requiring economic support by their former husbands. States did not revise such statutes until the 1970s so that men could also receive such financial support in the spirit of marital equity. It must have been quite shocking in the year 1900 for a man to sue for alimony.

The courts did not find in Ephraim’s favor in any of his lawsuits against Sarah. Even the divorce case was dropped, and officially the Shanabargers remained husband and wife. The remaining Shanabarger family property was ordered to be sold with Sarah receiving half of the proceeds. The other half went to pay off Ephraim’s creditors.43 The Shanabarger family never reconciled. Sarah and some of her children continued to live as Christian Israelites in the Texas colony.

Similar to other Christian Israelites, the members did not cut their hair and avoided non-kosher foods.44 Some sources described them as being vegetarians. It is not known if celibacy was promoted in this colony. If so, it was unsuccessful, as several children were born to the members while living in Texas. Perhaps they simply focused on avoiding fornication.45

Awaiting the Second Coming, the colony supported itself in part by lumbering off the timber on the property, and working as mill laborers.46 Sarah Shanabarger, of course, had used her money to support the colony and quite likely she helped the community survive longer than it might have otherwise. The New House of Israel commune had several log cabins as well as a church. Public religious services were held on Wednesday evenings and Sunday mornings every week.47 George Sutton, Francis
Shanabarger, and Andrew Turnbull served as ministers for the colony. Unlike some other Christian Israelite communes, it appears this group was more egalitarian, as Sutton never claimed to be a messenger and simply described himself as a minister. Census records list twenty-two members at the commune in 1900. An account from 1909 reported there were seventy-five members, and another reported seventy-five families, but data to support this is lacking. The Post Office for the community closed April 30, 1909, an unlikely event if the community was thriving, so these accounts are probably inaccurate.

Several factors worked against the longevity of the New House of Israel. The land where they settled was sparsely populated with few opportunities to attract converts. It was also rural, and typically Christian Israelite sects were more successful in urban areas. Additionally, George Sutton does not seem to have been a particularly charismatic leader, as most of his flock was family. Initially, timber produced some wealth for the commune, but after it was lumbered, the land was too poor to farm. Sarah Shanabarger, the primary financial support for the commune, died August 5, 1906. Her son Henry returned to Ohio with his family after her death.

Some sources claim that the community declined after Sutton’s death in 1924, but in actuality the group was in slow decline as members died or left and their numbers were not replaced with new believers. Andrew Turnbull and Francis Shanabarger continued as ministers after Sutton’s death, but by 1930 Turnbull, aged seventy-three, was working as a laborer on a truck farm. People may not have been attracted to the tenets of this unusual faith, and if the group had set 1901 as the date for Christ’s return, the failure of Jesus to appear certainly damaged their reputation. By 1930 only three of the faithful remained in the land called Israel. When they died by 1950 so did the dream of the millennium for this Christian Israelite commune.

Opposite: The only remaining artifact of the New House of Israel: the commune’s bell. Today it is installed in at the Polk County Memorial Museum in Livingston, Texas. Courtesy of the Polk County Memorial Museum
Notes

2. Ibid., 118.
3. Ibid., 119.
4. Ibid.
10. The House of David initially set a date of 1906, then 1916 or maybe 1917.
13. Leeson, *Commemorative Historical and Biographical Record*, 760.
14. There are a variety of spellings of the Shanabarger name in the primary sources (Shannabarger, Shinneberger). For simplicity, I am using one spelling uniformly.
15. Leeson, *Commemorative Historical and Biographical Record*, 759.
16. Ibid.
26. Leeson, *Commemorative Historical and Biographical Record*, 760.
30. Polk County Historical Society, Livingston, Texas.
32. Ibid.
38. Ibid.
51. Andrew Turnbull, Francis Shanabarger, and Emily Sutton. Emily’s daughter Ada also lived with her mother in 1940. Andrew died in 1932, Emily died in 1950, Francis died in 1944.